

Analyzing the Government and Non-Governmental Organization (NGO) impacts on the enrollment and dropout at primary level, in Nushki District of Balochistan

Social Sciences and Humanities

Mahjabeen Aziz Mengal¹ & Dr. Mumtaz A. Baloch²

Abstract

This article explains the impacts of government and NGO/Azat Foundation's schools on the enrollment and dropout, at primary level, in Nushki District of Balochistan. The required data and information were collected through questionnaire survey from 200 households where children were enrolled in Government and NGO schools. Additional information were gathered from households, group discussions, semi structured personal interviews and observation. The secondary data included books, journal articles and websites. The Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) was used to analyze the data. Data was analyzed through descriptive statistics and linear regression model. The findings of the study exposed a number of socio-economic factors dominantly effected the enrollment and dropout rates in both the government and NGO schools. For example, number of children (boys and girls) increased at household level, raised the enrollment rates. Similarly, parents' visit to school, boys and girls not enrolled in school and dropout cases in household positively influenced the enrollment rate. However, the enrollment rate likely went down in households where the annual income decreased and the dependency increased. The findings depicted that teachers' harsh behavior and lack of basic facilities significantly affected the enrollment rate of children in schools. Surprisingly, the dropped-out children had become examples for their parents in households. To avoid such incidents, parents reenrolled the dropped-out children in schools, without any delay. In this respect, parents meetings played an important role. On the contrary, the findings showed that long distance to schools and inadequate basic facilities have become major causes of dropout in the study area. We recommend the concerned authorities of government and Non-Governmental Organizations to raise awareness

¹ M.Phil. scholar (Education), Balochistan Study Center, University of Balochistan, Quetta

² Assistant Professor, Department of Social work, University of Balochistan, Quetta.

programs at household level, allocate sufficient budget and ensure provision of basic facilities including free transportation to improve the enrollment and overcome the dropout incidents, at primary level in Nushki District of Balochistan.

Key word: *Primary education, Government and NGO/Azat Foundation schools, Enrollment, Dropout, Nushki, Balochistan.*

1. Introduction

Education plays an important role in human development. Education process brings awareness, develops skills and abilities in human beings; and eventually makes good citizens (Government of Pakistan, 2004). According to the World Bank (2011), an educated child proved to be a better parent, taken effective decision and earned a very good living compared to an illiterate. In 1999-2008, 77% to 86% girl's enrollment has been increased in primary schools of developing countries (UNESCO, 2011). On contrary, Glewwe and Kremer (2005), argued that in developing countries education system faces many problems due meager resources, absence of teachers and less qualified teachers. Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) proved to be improving the education system in developing countries including Pakistan. For example, NGO schools provide books free of cost and necessary stationery; collaborate with governments and supported the government schools by providing funds for buildings, and basic facilities such as, drinking water and washrooms (Iqbal, 2009; Mundy & Murphy, 2001). Overall, NGO schools seemed to have been more effective in providing better primary education compared to Government schools in developing countries (Khan, 2005; Asfhaq, 2015).

NGOs are widely known collaborating with government and non-state providers of basic services. When government is unable to fulfill the responsibilities in education sectors, NGOs move forward to intervene (Doftory, 2004). In Pakistan, formal government gratitude of NGOs has aroused mostly since the 1990s (Batley and Rose, 2010). According to Lynd (2007), 9% of primary schools in Pakistan even did not have blackboards, 24% were suffered from the absence of course books for students, and 46% are suffering from unavailability of desks as compared to these rough edges of Government schools. NGOs provide almost all required facilities to their schools. However, in presence of many I/NGOs in Balochistan, the literacy rate seemed to have been stagnant for decades. According to The Human Rights of Commission of Pakistan, in Balochistan, the quality of education is poorer than the other provinces of the country, a number of children are still

out of school and the rate of enrollment is still lower and slower (HRCP, 2014). Consequently, Balochistan is the least literate province of Pakistan. *“Our teachers are not properly trained. Instead of adopting a dictatorial attitude towards students, they should focus on learning”* (Ahmed, 2013). According to a survey report (Dawn, 2013), due to political favor, majority of teachers in government schools do not bother to perform duties. It happened due to poor governance. As a result, 78% of children in Balochistan are deprived of primary education.

Pakistan is among those countries which ratified the global legislations to achieve success and progress in education sector. In 2000, Pakistan ratified Dakar Framework of Action for Education for All (EFA) and the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The constitutional Article 25a “the State shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years, in such manner as may be determined by law” that the state to make responsible to its Government schools to ensure quality education at all level. Nevertheless, both the Government and NGOs seemed to have been failed to achieve the aforementioned goals. Pakistan has a net enrollment ratio (NER) of 57% for children enrolled, whereas the target was 100% (http://sparcpk.org/sopc2014/Education_Chapter_2014.pdf). Government and NGO schools are the key intervening sources for providing primary education in developing countries. However, still many children from poor families do not equally benefit from Government and NGO schools (Doftory, 2004).

With the collaboration of government some of Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) have played an important role to promote and facilitate the primary education in Pakistan since 1947 (Azhar, 1991, Saeed 2000; Baloch, 2010). However, in accordance of economic survey of Pakistan it is the responsibility of Pakistan to achieve all the millennium goals (MDGs) and other international education goals such as, Education for All (EFA), to have success in primary level of education. Unfortunately, in achieving these millennium goals Pakistan is still lagging behind as compare to the other countries (PSLM 2010-2011). Low enrollment and high dropout is a great challenge for Pakistan at primary level of education (Malik, 2002). Primary education is being ignored in terms of essential facilities and resources (Illahi, 1989; Batley et al., 2010).

In Balochistan, different NGOs are involved to collaborate with government to improve the education system. In Noshki District, Azat Foundation AF has established a few full-fledged primary and high schools, perceived to be more

effective when compared with government schools. In this regard, no such research has been conducted to compare the government and NGO or Azad Foundation schools' enrollment and dropout cases, including the factors associated. Hence, this study analyzed the factors that effected the enrollment and dropout in both the Government and NGO schools.

2. Study area

Nushki District was selected as the study area for this research. Nushki is one of the poorest districts where both the Government and NGOs are engaged to educate people. There are approximately 152 Government and 7 NGO primary schools in Nushki <http://nushkal.shaigle.com/>. The study analyzed that effected the enrollment and dropout in government and NGO schools.

Balochistan is the least literate province of Pakistan. According to a survey report (Dawn, 2013), due to political support, majority of teachers in government schools do not bother to take classes. Because of that about 78% of children in Baluchistan are deprived of primary education. According to BEMIS 2009, in district Nushki, the government primary schools are often functioning without lots of basic and essential facilities, such as appropriate building, electricity, water facility, toilet, furniture, reading and writing materials and the most important well-educated teachers as well –that eventually affected the enrollment and dropout rate in district Nushki. (GoB, 2011). Azad Foundation (AF) Baluchistan in particular and National Commission for Human Development (NCHD) appear to be the leading NGOs providing education either free of cost or charging an affordable fee. For provision of quality education to poor and marginalized community, Azad Foundation with the support of Action Aid Pakistan has established six (06) community schools in district Nushki. In addition, realizing the importance of girls' education AF with the support of IIm (Ideas Education Innovation) has established seven (07) campus community cluster schools for girls, provided almost all facilities, in order to enhance education in areas (<http://www.azatfoundation.org/program-components/education>).

3. Methods of data collection and analysis

This was a descriptive and explanatory type of study. The research applied both the quantitative and qualitative techniques to explore the performance of Government and NGO interventions in improving the primary education and to assess the social, economic and the institutional factors that effected the primary education enrollment and dropout rate. Required data was collected through primary and secondary sources. The Reconnaissance Survey (RS)

supported to acquire the secondary data and observe the schools' conditions. Moreover, during the RS necessary data were gathered such as, enrollment and dropout rate and number of teachers. Through questionnaire survey both qualitative and quantitative data was collected. Four Focus Group Discussions (two with each type of school) were held. During the Focus Group Discussions and key informant interviews useful information was gathered from parents, community members, teachers and Government and NGO schools' principals on the enrollment and dropout rate and the major causes. The observation tool significantly helped to see the ground realities for instance, teachers' behavior, available facilities in schools and the enrollment both in schools and households. The secondary data included published research articles, books, annual reports of Government and I/NGOs and websites. To analyze the data initially, descriptive statistics was used including mean, frequency distribution, percentage and multiple regressions (linear regression).

3.1 Sample size and sample design

Out of 700 households, 200 were randomly targeted. The required data and information were collected from households where the sampled schools' children lived. Categorically, 100 households were targeted from government and the other 100 from NGO beneficiary households. Initially, 10 questionnaires were pretested and necessary modifications were made (Table 1). It is notified that the pretested questionnaires have not been included in the sampled size.

Table 1 Government and NGO schools

Name of Schools	Estimated enrollment	Households sampled
Government schools		
Primary School Saydan Killi Mengal	97	30
Primary school Qazi Abad Noshki.	172	70
NGO schools		
Azat Foundation School Qazi Abad	472	80
Primary School Sardar Abdul Samad Dak Noshki	44	20
Total		200

4. Factors effecting the enrollment rate in Government and NGO schools

The linear regression model ("stepwise method") was found 'best fit' to analyze the assumed and hypothesized factors which doomed to have influenced the enrollment rate in Government and NGO schools" at primary level. The model revealed that 84% of the variation.

The model is specified as follows:

$$Y = b_0 + b_1X_1 + b_2X_2 + \dots + b_nX_n + u_i$$

Y = Enrollment rate at household level

b₀= Constant

b₁-b_n= Coefficient of the independent variables

u_i random term

Following twenty-nine (29) factors were included in linear regression to understand the factors that significantly influenced the enrollment rate in Government and NGO schools, categorically.

X₁ Age of household head, X₂ annual income of household, X₃ household size, X₄ number of children in household, X₅ number of dependents in household, X₆ number of girls in household, X₇ number of boys not enrolled, X₈ distance from house to school, X₉ time to reach to school, X₁₀ education status of household head, X₁₁ visit of household head/s to school, X₁₂ number of not enrolled girls, X₁₃ number of boys in household, X₁₄ number of boys in household, X₁₅ total number of children in household not enrolled, X₁₆ means of transportation, X₁₇ library, X₁₈ first aid facility, X₁₉ furniture, X₂₀ toilets, X₂₁ electricity at school, X₂₂ physically punishment, X₂₃ total number of enrolled children, X₂₄ playground, X₂₅ environment of school, X₂₆ dropout cases of girls, X₂₇ dropout cases of boys, X₂₈ Government School teachers' behavior, X₂₉ NGO school teachers' behavior.

5 Results

The linear regression (stepwise method) unveiled 8 factors that significantly influenced the enrollment rate of both girls and boys in the Government and NGO schools, in District Nushki of Balochistan. Out of eight factors associated, six variables significantly and positively influenced the enrollment rate at primarily level. However, two factors affected the enrollment namely, the environment of Government schools and total number of not enrolled children (Table 1).

5.1 Positively associated variables

The results of the analysis indicated that 'parents' visits to school' significantly influenced the enrollment rate, both in the Government and NGO schools. For example, it not only helped in increasing the 'enrollment rate of boys and girls and those were not enrolled at that time; but it also positively impacted the entire school age children's enrollment including the 'dropout cases', at household level, in Nushki district of Balochistan. In

addition, parents likely enrolled their children in schools where the better toilet facility existed.

Results showed that NGO teachers appeared be more amicable and cohesive compared to Government school teachers. Findings showed that 76% of parents visited schools when invited; it stimulated parents to enroll other children. Parents visit to schools in particular and meeting at community level seemed to have positively impacted the enrollment rate.

Findings of the study revealed that all Government schools were with very miserable condition of toilets and mostly lacking the water facility. Even one Government school had no any toilet facility for children. In this regards, NGO schools provided well facilitates such as, toilet, water and better environment. However, parents informed that NGO schools charged monthly fee in the study area (like private schools).

5.2 Negatively associated variables

Teachers' negative 'behavior' and 'dependency' at household level significantly hindered the enrollment rate (Table 1). In addition, there were average 6 dependent persons in every household. Almost all people depended on one person. It has eventually affected the enrollment rate. Results illustrated that 46% of students faced corporal punishment by school teachers.

Table 1 Regression coefficients of variables influencing the 'enrolment' in Government and NGO schools

Variables	Description	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	T	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
(Constant)		-3.015	.483		-6.239	.000
X ₁ Children in household	Number	.649	.040	.944	16.329	.000
X ₂ Parents visit to school	1 if parents visited school; 0 if not visited.	.454	.184	.110	2.473	.014
X ₃ Boys not enrolled in household level	Number	.118	.027	.240	4.369	.000
X ₄ Girls not enrolled	Number	.154	.028	.301	5.405	.000
X ₅ Dependents at household	Number	-.111	.036	-.175	-3.077	.002
X ₆ Dropout cases in household	Number	.100	.030	.175	3.349	.001
X ₇ School teachers' behavior	1 if NGO school; 0 if government	-.842	.185	-.234	-4.555	.000

	school.					
X ₈ X ₈ Basic facilities in schools (safe drinking water, electricity, washroom,	Satisfied; 0 if not.	.782	.188	.194	4.149	.000

Field survey, 2016

6. Factors influencing the dropout in Government and NGO schools

Following twenty nine (29) factors were included in the linear regression model. The model (stepwise method) detected nine (9) variables that significantly influenced the dropout incidents. The model depicted 80% of the variation.

X₁ Age of household head, X₂ annual income of household, X₃ household size, X₄ number of children in household, X₅ number of dependents in household, X₆ number of girls in household, X₇ number of boys not enrolled, X₈ distance from house to school, X₉ time to reach to school, X₁₀ education status of household head, X₁₁ visit of household head/s to school, X₁₂ number of not enrolled girls, X₁₃ number of boys in household, X₁₄ number of boys in household, X₁₅ total number of children in household not enrolled, X₁₆ means of transportation, X₁₇ library, X₁₈ first aid facility, X₁₉ furniture, X₂₀ toilets, X₂₁ electricity at school, X₂₂ physically punishment, X₂₃ total number of enrolled children, X₂₄ playground, X₂₅ environment of school, X₂₆ dropout cases of girls, X₂₇ dropout cases of boys, X₂₈ Government School teachers' behavior, X₂₉ NGO school teachers' behavior.

Model specification

The model is specified as follows:

$$Y = b_0 + b_1X_1 + b_2X_2 + \dots + b_nX_n + u_i$$

Y = Dropout rate at household level

b₀= Constant

b₁-b_n= Coefficient of the independent variables

u_i random term

6.1 Positively associated variables influencing the dropout rate

Following variables played a significant role to decreasing the dropout rates.

For instance, X₂dropout cases of girls, X₃dropout cases of boys, X₄boys not enrolled in household level and X₆ parents meeting in school.

Results of the analysis indicated that the dropped out children had become examples for other children in households to avoid such incidents. For example, children already dropped out, at early stage, were reenrolled in schools. In this respect, parents meetings at schools and community level played very important role. Consequently, it contributed in decreasing the dropout rate, at household level (Table 2).

6.2 Negatively associated factors accelerating the dropout cases

Results of regression unveiled 5 factors that seemed to have accelerated the dropout incidents in study area. For instance, X_1 age of household head, X_6 number of enrolled boys, X_7 distance to school and X_8 electricity (Table 2).

Results showed that the increasing 'age of household head' was negatively associated. For example, dropout cases likely increased where the household heads' age was found higher.

The already 'dropped out children' in households seemingly augmented the situation. As a result, distance to schools appeared to be a major cause of dropout. Findings illustrated that 69% of children walked far-flung area to schools. On the other hand, 24% of parents hired private cabs to commute to schools and 7% of them managed their own, mostly through motorbikes and cars.

Government school buildings were constructed very far from the major population. It has significantly affected enrollment rate and somehow caused dropout.

Boys enrolled in schools seemed to become a challenge to decrease or overcome dropout incidence. In this respect, biologically well-grown boys in the co-education system, particularly in government schools had become challenge for girls. It happened mostly in one-teacher schools due to increased enrollment rate and poor monitoring. This why, some parents stopped sending their children to such schools. However, parents meetings played an important role preventing the dropout occurrences. The chilling winter and hot days of summer appeared to equally affected the enrollment and dropout rate. Analysis of the regression detected that unavailability of electricity and water and washroom were additional challenges to improve the enrollment rate and overcome the dropout incidents in Nushki District (Table 2).

Table 2: Regression coefficients of factors effecting the dropout incidence in Government and NGO schools

Variables	Distribution	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
(Constant)		.181	1.008		.179	.858
X ₁ Age of household head	Number	-.032	.014	-.089	-2.212	.028
X ₂ Dropout cases of girls	Number	.681	.042	.696	16.277	.000
X ₃ Dropout cases of boys	Number	.327	.046	.284	7.047	.000
X ₄ Boys not enrolled in household level	Number	.092	.033	.108	2.835	.005
X ₅ Parents meeting in school	1 if attended the meetings in school; 0 if not.	.895	.338	.742	2.644	.009
X ₆ Number of enrolled boys	Number	-.073	.043	-.060	-1.685	.094
X ₇ Distance to school	Distance to school	-.582	.296	-.082	-1.963	.051
X ₈ Basic facilities in schools (safe drinking water, electricity, washroom,	1 if available; 0 if not.	-.627	.257	-.099	-2.445	.016

Field survey, 2016

7. Discussions

Studies showed that in developing countries including Pakistan whenever governments failed to provide educational facilities by then NGOs intervened the communities and households to fillup the gaps (CSS Forum, 2016). With approximately 152 Government schools, there are 7 NGO primary schools in Nushki to provide their services to bring quality education <http://nushkal.shaigle.com/>. However, this study revealed the failure of both the sectors government and NGO to bring quality education, enhance enrollment and decrease the dropout rates in district Noshki. A number of socioeconomic and institutional factors were assumed to be affecting the enrollment and dropout of primary school children in government and NGO schools in the district such as, total number of children in household, parents' frequent visit to school, boys not enrolled in school, number of girls not enrolled in school and dropout cases in household significantly increase the enrollment rats. Nonetheless, number of dependents in household, negative behavior of school teachers and the institutional factors such as, scarcity of basic facilities in school were the factors significantly decreasing the enrollment rates. Similarly, dropout cases of girls, dropout cases of boys, those boys who were not enrolled in school and parents meeting in school hypothesized to be decrease the dropout cases. However, number of enrolled

boys in school, long distance of school from home and insufficiency of schools basic facilities significantly raised the rates of dropout.

7.1 Factors affecting the enrollment and dropout, at primary level

Quality of education and child's good care in schools created the sense of likeness for schools in children and created an atmosphere that allowed other children of households to be enrolled in both the government and NGO schools. Nevertheless, the study illustrated that in government schools the trend of parents' meeting was not practiced which resulted in a significant gap between parents and school-that indirectly affected the enrollment rates and increased dropouts in government schools. However, family members, community and parents' contribution and involvement in form of parents' school meetings not only improved children's learning process, it also increased the enrollment rates in NGO schools. Same as, in the study area due to poverty and parents' lack of awareness most of children (boys and girls) involved with labor and missed the opportunity to be enrolled or had dropout of school. The miserable condition and concern for future of these children motivated most of parents to enroll their other children in school.

Nushki is among those districts of Balochistan where the 90% of the population is living below the poverty line (DDP, 2011). The findings of the study showed that "*high dependency rate*" in households with the severe poverty appeared to be one of the key factors decreasing the enrolment rates in both the sectors government and NGO. Despite the provision of free books and eradication of school fee mostly parents seemed to against of enrolling their children in schools due to other expenses of schooling such as, school uniform, stationary, meal and cost of transportation, especially in NGO schools where the parents had to pay the school fee.

7.2 Effects of teachers' behavior on the enrollment and dropout of children

Teachers' good behavior is the milestone to achieve academic targets and creating optimistic impacts in student's character. Amicable behavior of teachers and school staff seemed to have positively influenced the enrollment rate in the study area. However, harsh behavior appeared to be one of the main causes of increasing dropout cases in sampled schools. The results showed that the behavior of teachers in government schools appeared to be

unethical and harsh which resulted with a great gap between teacher and students and significantly lessen the enrollment rates.

The study illustrated one of the major causes of dropping out of children was the grown age enrolled boys in schools. NGO Schools in the study area were found to be co-education. Pakistani society has compounded subtleties due to diversity in ethics and traditions. In some tribal, traditional and conservative areas of Pakistan co-education is not encouraged. It has negative impacts on girls' education. In district Nushki the situation is somewhat changed. People are not conservative minded, but they love and respect their values and ethics. They prefer to enroll their daughters in single-gender schools. The study revealed that grown age boys used to harass girls and younger boys in schools. This eventually increased the dropout cases in NGO schools.

7.3 Long distance and lack of basic facilities in schools

Insufficiency and bad condition of all the important and required facilities like toilets, water, electricity, transportation, sufficient classrooms and furniture adversely affected the enrollment rate and had become a great challenge to reduce the dropout rate in both the Government and NGO schools. The study revealed that about 69% of the students of both the schools (government and NGO) walked across a long distance to their schools. It happened because the schools did not have any free transportation facility for poor students. Results showed that 31% of the students commuted through private vans. Similarly, results showed approximately 95% of parents were dissatisfied with the availability of electricity and washroom facilities of government schools. Students in the hottest days of summer had to sit in classroom without fans which ominously increased the dropout cases. While, the case was appeared to be changed in NGO schools, about 57% of parents were satisfied with the accessibility of electricity and washroom facilities. Almost all parents were dissatisfied with fresh and clean drinking water provided in government and NGO schools.

8. Conclusion and recommendations

Education is considered as the foundation for the uplifting of a nation. However, Pakistan in general, Balochistan particularly in this context is lagging behind. This study analyzed the impacts government and NGO schools in district Nushki, Balochistan. The crux of the study portrayed that the NGO schools proved to provide better facilities and services compared to government schools. For example, NGO schools provided basic facilities for

instance, electricity, sufficient classrooms, furniture and toilets/washrooms. Most importantly, NGO schools treated children amicably. They were answerable to their principals. On the other hand, government schools' teachers did not care much. It happened because of political influence and the poor management system. However, the study also showed some variables that negatively associated with the image of NGO schools in the study area such as, some NGO schools charged fees from students, which was unaffordable to the poor parents. However, this study depicted that both the government NGO schools legged behind to provide quality education to increase the enrolment and decrease the dropout cases at primary level in district Nushki. Parents meetings held in schools played a great role in improving the enrollment and reducing the dropout incidents. I recommend that not only NGO but also government schools need to conduct monthly parents meetings. Concerned institutions required to train the teachers regarding the modern teaching pedagogy. Moreover, the authorities need to visit schools and meet children to investigate teachers' behavior. Such initiatives contribute in improving the education system. Provision of basic facilities (safe drinking water, electricity, washroom; and equipment for sports and recreational activities) can stimulate parents and children to take part in improving the education system in the study area. The so-called awareness in the media cannot work well unless and until the required facilities are provided to destitute and poor families. For instance, free transportation, security including books, uniform and necessary nutrition. Last but not least, Government and NGOs need to collaborate effectively not only to improve the enrollment and overcome the dropout but provide quality education in Balochistan, Nushki district particularly.

References

- Batley, R and Rose, P. (2010). Collaboration in delivering education relations between governments and NGOs in south Asia, UK.
- CSS Forum (2016). The role of NGOs in the 3rd world countries International Relations Notes on IR. CSS Forum, Civil Services of Pakistan.
- DDP (2011). District Development Profile
- Glew, P. Kremmer, M. (2005). Schools, teachers and education outcomes in developing countries.

- G.O.P (2004). National Education Policy Pakistan in: Ministry of Education. G.O.P(ed) Islamabad.
- GoB (2011). District profile, Nushki, Quetta.
- HHRCP, (2014). State of Human Rights in 2014. Human Rights Commission of Pakistan Aiwan-i-Jamhoo, 107-Tipu Block, New Garden Town, Lahore-54600
- Ishfaq, S. (2015). Comparative analysis of primary education at NGO, private and public school in Muzaffarabad, Azad Kashmir.
- Iqbal, J. (2009). Role of non-governmental organizations for the development of basic education in Punjab, Pakistan.
- Khan, S. (2015). A comparative institutional analysis of government NGO and private rural primary schooling in Pakistan.
- Mundy, K and Murphy, L. (2001). Transnational advocacy global civil society? Emerging evidence from the field of education comparative education review 45 no 185-126.
- UNESCO (2011). Policy analysis of education in Balochistan. Islamabad, Pakistan.
- NDEP (2016-17). Nushki District Education Plan (2016-17 to 2020-21). Balochistan, Pakistan.
- PILDAT, (2011). Background Paper. Right to Free and Compulsory Education in Pakistan. Enforcement of Article 25-A of the Constitution of Pakistan. Published by PILDAT, Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency. Islamabad, Pakistan.
- Shah AS, Naeem M, S M (2013). Eighteenth Amendment in the Constitution of Pakistan and Fundamental Rights International Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences (IJHSS) ISSN 2319-393X Vol. 2, Issue 4, Sep 2013, 7-10
- UNESCO. (2011). *Policy analysis of education in Balochistan*. Islamabad, Pakistan.

Websites

- www.azatfoundation.org/programmecomponent/education
- www.inteface.edu.pk/students/may-08/primary-education.asp
- www.dnd.com.pk/comparative-analysis-of-primary-education-at-ngos-private-and-public-schools-in-muzaffarabad-azad-kashmir/88830
- www.betadawn.com/new/784499govt-run-schoolteachersdo-not-takeclasses-report-78pcchildren-miss-primaryeducation